

## City of San Pablo

One Alvarado Square 13831 San Pablo Avenue San Pablo, CA 94806 www.ci.san-pablo.ca.us

Rhone 510.215.3012 • Fax 510.620.0204

RECEIVED

Office of the City Manager

May 20, 2008

MAY 28 2008 THEASURER STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Mr. Robert Grossman Group Managing Director U.S. Public Finance Fitch Ratings 33 Whitehall Street, 27<sup>th</sup> Fl. New York, NY 10004 Ms. Gail Sussman Group Managing Director Public Finance Moody's Investors Service 250 Greenwich Street New York, NY 10007 Mr. William Montrone Head U.S. Public Finance Dept. Standard & Poor's 55 Water Street New York, NY 10041

Re: Ending Double Standard in Ratings of Municipal and Corporate Bonds

Dear Mr. Grossman, Ms. Sussman and Mr. Montrone:

The current system of assigning credit ratings to bonds issued by governmental entities which provide essential services the public leads to indefensible market discrimination against state and local municipal issuers. The rating agencies' own studies show that the likelihood of default by municipal borrowers is much lower than for corporate borrowers with similar ratings. Ratings should be based primarily on an evaluation of the likelihood investors will suffer a loss due to default. Unfortunately, for municipal bonds, they are not. This practice costs taxpayers enormous amounts of money that could be invested in public programs and infrastructure.

The City Council of the City of San Pablo recently adopted a resolution (copy enclosed) urging your companies to end the double-standard in the treatment of municipal and corporate bonds. The City Council urges you to treat taxpayers the same as corporations and rate municipal bonds based on the risk investor loss due to default. Finally, we urge you to do this by creating a unified, global rating approach that treats all issuers equally, thereby better serving taxpayers and investors.

Thank you,

Brock T. Arner City Manager

Enclosure

cc: California State Treasurer Bill Lockyer

Mayor and San Pablo City Council

Burket linner

## RESOLUTION 2008-054

RESOLUTION SUPPORTING REFORM OF THE BOND RATING SYSTEM TO ELIMINATE DISCRIMINATION AGAINST MUNICIPAL BONDS

WHEREAS, the recent turmoil in the municipal bond markets has brought into focus the higher standards imposed by the three major bond rating agencies in rating municipal bonds compared to corporate bonds, mortgage-backed securities and other debt instruments;

WHEREAS, issuers of municipal bonds rarely default on the bonds they sell to finance streets and roads, public buildings, bridges, flood protection and water systems, and other critical infrastructure, yet municipal bond ratings fail to reflect that fundamental fact;

WHEREAS, the rating agencies even acknowledge this disparity, but they ignore it in their ratings. Standard & Poor's, for example, acknowledges that the historic rate of defaults of A-rated municipal bonds is 0.23 percent, while that of corporate bonds is 2.91 percent - or 13 times greater;

WHEREAS, despite the relative default rates shown by their own data, the rating agencies continue to discriminate against municipal issuers, requiring public agencies to secure expensive bond insurance in order to secure bond ratings comparable to those of private corporations;

WHEREAS, the rating agencies base their ratings of corporate bonds on the risk the issuer will default. Their ratings of municipal bonds, in contrast, have little relationship to the risk of default. This difference provides a substantial economic benefit at the expense of taxpayers across the nation:

WHEREAS, a coalition of state and local public agencies, led by California State Treasurer Bill Lockyer, has called on the three major rating agencies to examine their practices and treat municipal bonds on par with corporate bonds that expose investors to the same level of risk. The Treasurer also testified before the House Financial Services Committee on March 12 about the need for reform;

WHEREAS, the response by the rating agencies to the call for reform has been uneven. Moody's has taken the greatest strides, announcing it will assign a corporate-equivalency rating (what it calls a global scale rating or GSR) alongside the traditional municipal rating to any municipal bond at the issuer's request; and

WHEREAS, the current double-standard by rating agencies: (1) drains billions of dollars from taxpayers' pockets in the form of unfairly high interest rates; (2) forces taxpayers to pay even more money to buy bond insurance – insurance they would not have to purchase if municipal bond ratings accurately reflected the slight risk of default; (3) misleads investors by grossly inflating the risk of buying municipal bonds; and (4) undermines the effective functioning of a transparent market.

> i hereby cerufy that the foregoing is a full, true and correct copy of Persolution 2008054 Elmus 8 Lehny M. Corbin, Deputy City Clerk

Executive Secretary

Resolution 2008-054

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the City Council of the City ofSan Pablo that it calls on the major municipal bond agencies to end the double standard in the treatment of municipal and corporate bonds; to treat taxpayers the same as corporations and rate municipal bonds based on the risk of default; and to create a unified, global rating approach that treats all issuers equally, and better serves taxpayers and investors.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City Manager, or his designee, is hereby directed to notify the municipal bond rating agencies by letter of the adoption of this resolution, with a copy to California State Treasurer Bill Lockyer and to register the City as a member of the coalition of public agencies supporting the nationwide effort to reform how bond rating agencies grade state and local bonds.

ADOPTED this 19th day of May, 2008, by the following vote:

AYES:

COUNCILMEMBERS:

McNeil, Calloway, Gomes, Morris and Brown

NOES:

COUNCILMEMBERS:

None

ABSENT: COUNCILMEMBERS:

None

ABSTAIN: COUNCILMEMBERS:

None

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

/s/ Ted J. Denney
Ted J. Denney, City Clerk

/s/ Sharon J. Brown Sharon J. Brown, Mayor

Resolution 2008-054 Page 2